

Jointly Held
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees
Meeting Minutes

September 18, 2018

Members Present: Sharon Hairston, Jointly Held Committee Chair, Board Vice President
Franz Hoge
Sharon Howard, Chair, Planning Committee
John Lumpkin, Chair, Finance/Personnel Committee
Belinda Matthews-Stenson
Thomas Weckesser
David P. Williamson, Chair, Investment Advisory Committee

Excused Absence: Vince Corrado
Adrienne Heard, Board President

Staff in Attendance: Mark Donaghy
Julie Beard
Daron Brown
Sally Brown
Roland Caldwell
Chris Cole
Chris Conard, Coolidge Wall
Skip Dunkle
Tim Harrington
Deborah Howard
Nick Mantia
Nikol Miller
Brandon Policicchio
Bob Ruzinsky
Mary K. Stanforth
Bob Stevens

Others Attending: Beth Bailey, McGohan Brabender
Tara Harpold, McGohan Brabender
Dr. Richard Henry, League of Women Voters

Call to Order

Ms. Hairston called the meeting to order at 9:15 a.m. A quorum was present and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority

Approval of August 21, 2018 Meeting Minutes

Ms. Hairston asked if attendees desired a reading of the minutes or if there were any corrections to the minutes? Upon hearing no requests or corrections, Ms. Hairston declared ACCEPTANCE of the August 21, 2018 meeting minutes.

September 2018 Board Action Items:

Action Item #2 – Transit – Mobility as a Service Pilot Program

Mr. Policicchio stated this action item will allow the Chief Executive Officer of Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) to enter into a five (5) year strategic partnership agreement with *Transit*, a multi-modal trip planning App Company. Together, both parties will pilot and launch a fully functional Mobility-as-a-Service (MaaS) platform for the region. The platform will allow for the phased integration of various mobility components, such as fixed route, paratransit, on-demand, human service transportation, bike share, taxi, transit network companies (TNC), car-share and other forms of shared mobility. It is understood that RTA's future fare payment system vendor(s) will work exclusively with Transit in order to deliver the fully functional MaaS platform.

This action item aligns with RTA's core values of Quality Service and Stewardship and moves RTA towards blurring the lines of mobility into one seamless, integrated network of services that enhances the customer experience for all.

According to the MaaS Alliance, "*Mobility as a Service puts users, both travelers and goods, at the core of transport services, offering them tailor-made mobility solutions based on their individual needs. This means that, for the first time, easy access to the most appropriate transport mode or service will be included in a bundle of flexible travel service options for end users.*"

Staff believes that Transit is uniquely positioned to be our primary MaaS partner given the app's widespread adoption among RTA's existing customer base and its robust feature set. We are recommending a sole source justification for this partnership which is outlined within a supporting memo. In the proposed partnership, Transit will be responsible for ensuring that the purchasing experience is seamlessly integrated into the app, but the actual secure fare media would be directly supplied by the fare payment system vendor(s). In addition, the fare payment system vendor(s) will also be responsible for payment processing, fare validation, equipment, and backend system management of the mobile ticketing solution including reporting and analytics. Both Transit and the future fare payment system vendor(s) will carry appropriate payment card industry (PCI) compliance credentials.

Project Timeline and Implementation Approach

The pilot project period will be phased as follows:

1. Launch a multimodal consumer app – Q1 2019
2. Integrate payments across different modes – 2019-2020
3. Deploy a fully functional MaaS platform – 2021-2023

Pilot Project Budget

Staff will work with Transit, future fare payment system vendor(s) and other partners to develop individual, yet beneficial and aligned incentive revenue sharing model(s) and budget(s) aimed to

reduce RTA's current annual operating and capitalized maintenance costs. This pilot's budget will be brought to the RTA Board of Trustees for approval in the 1st quarter of 2019.

MOTION made by Mr. Lumpkin and SECONDED by Mr. Weckesser that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees AUTHORIZATION for RTA's Chief Executive Officer to enter into a five (5) year strategic partnership agreement with *Transit* - a multi-modal trip planning app company. Together, both parties will pilot and launch a fully functional Mobility-as-a-Service platform for the region. The platform will allow for the phased integration of various mobility components, such as fixed route, paratransit, on-demand, human service transportation, bike share, taxi, transit network companies, car-share and other forms of shared mobility to be integrated and accessible from a single platform. This includes AUTHORITY to establish agreements, determine appropriate funding sources and revenue sharing models that will be reflected within RTA's short and long-term budgets. The Motion was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #3 – Surveying – Engineering and Related Services

Mr. Ruzinsky explained that RTA desires to obtain a qualified consultant to provide professional surveying, engineering and related services to support various projects.

Examples of some of the projects contemplated by RTA over the next five to seven years include:

- Electric System Infrastructure Improvements
- General Substation Improvements
- Electric Trolley Bus Pole Replacements
- Transit Centers & Facility Improvements
- General Transit Enhancements
- Bus Stop, Bus Pull-offs, and Shelter Layouts

Some, but not all, tasks which the selected surveying-engineering firm may be requested to perform are:

- Provide field and plan data for installations of Electric Trolley Bus (ETB) items
- Pole staking
- Right-of-way layout
- Bus shelter layout and staking
- Road layout/mapping, curbs, sidewalk, poles, trees, etc.
- Strategic and Master Planning
- Miscellaneous survey work

Once the RTA identifies a project/task, the Surveying firm under contract will be requested to submit a proposal for said project/task. RTA will retain the right not to use the firm under contract if an agreement on the proposal cannot be reached. This procurement is consistent with RTA's core value of Stewardship, as we demonstrate our commitment to manage our resources efficiently and responsibly.

A qualification based procurement method was used where criteria other than price was used to determine the most qualified firm. After the top firm was selected by the evaluation committee, pricing was requested from that firm only.

The Evaluation Committee reviewed the proposals to determine the most qualified proposer using the following criteria:

- Understanding RTA’s needs
- Previous experience with similar projects
- Specific skills and relevant affiliations
- Financial and technical capability of the proposer
- References
- Quality proposal preparation and presentation, if applicable

The following firms submitted proposals:

Brumbaugh Engineering & Surveying, LLC West Milton, OH
The Kleingers Group Dayton, OH
Barge Design Solutions, Inc. Miamisburg, OH
Briggs Creative Services, LLC Mason, OH
Admiral Engineering & Surveying, Inc.* Dayton, OH

*Admiral Engineering was determined non-responsive due to submission of pricing with their proposal.

After evaluations and presentations, Brumbaugh Engineering & Surveying (BES) was selected by the evaluation committee as the top ranked firm, and their pricing was requested. The hourly fee structure proposed by BES is as follows:

Classification	Hourly Rate Year 1	Hourly Rate Year 2	Hourly Rate Year 3	Hourly Rate Year 4	Hourly Rate Year 5	Hourly Rate Opt. Year 1	Hourly Rate Opt. Year 2
Principal Prof. Engineer/Surveyor	\$130	\$134	\$138	\$142	\$146	\$150	\$155
Staff Engineer/Surveyor	\$115	\$118	\$121	\$124	\$128	\$132	\$136
Engineering/CAD Technician	\$100	\$103	\$106	\$109	\$112	\$115	\$119
Field Survey Crew (2-Man)	\$145	\$149	\$154	\$159	\$163	\$168	\$173
Field Survey Crew (1-Man)	\$110	\$113	\$116	\$120	\$124	\$128	\$132
Administrative/Clerical	\$ 60	\$ 62	\$ 64	\$ 66	\$ 68	\$ 71	\$ 74

Reimbursable supplies and expenses are to be billed at direct cost with no mark up.

A cost analysis was conducted which considered previous rates paid by RTA for similar work, regional and national averages, and rates paid to BES by the State of Ohio. The hourly fees were found to be fair and reasonable. Surveyor-Engineering & Related Services will be paid with operating funds and capital funds if services are part of a larger capital project. Expenditures are estimated to be \$50,000 per year under this contract.

MOTION made by Mr. Williamson and SECONDED by Ms. Matthews-Stenson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Brumbaugh Engineering & Surveying, LLC for a five-year period at a not-to-exceed total of \$250,000, plus \$50,000 for Option Year 1 and \$50,000 for Option Year 2, for a grand total not to exceed amount of \$350,000. The motion was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #4 – Five Year Global Concrete Contract

Mr. Brown stated the purpose of this procurement is for the RTA to establish a long term contract with a qualified firm for concrete work throughout RTA’s facilities, infrastructure and amenities.

This work includes, but is not limited to, new concrete, upgrades to existing concrete areas and/or replacement of concrete areas such as driveways, bus lanes (large pads on city streets), approaches, curbs, curb cuts for wheelchair accessibility, shelter pads, bench pads, small retaining walls and sidewalk pads.

This project is consistent with RTA’s core value of Stewardship by allowing proper management of resources and maintenance of assets.

Bids were requested for the Known Concrete Work, Miscellaneous Concrete Work and Potential Concrete Work.

The bid results are as follows:

	Belgray, Inc. Wilmington, OH	L. J. DeWeese Co. Inc. Tipp City, OH	*Leo B. Schroeder Inc. Dayton, OH	*Arcon Builders Arcanum, OH
Description	Base Years	Base Years		
Known Concrete Work	\$1,063,274.33	\$1,743,600.00	*	*
Miscellaneous Concrete Work	195,702.03	382,050.00		
Total	\$1,258,976.36	\$2,125,650.00		
Potential Concrete Work	681,062.47	898,150.00		
Total Base Years	\$1,940,038.83	\$3,023,800.00		
	Option Years	Option Years		
Known Concrete Work	753,891.00	1,162,400.00		
Miscellaneous Concrete Work	138,758.17	254,700.00		
Grand Total	\$2,832,688.00	\$4,440,900.00		

*Nonresponsive-did not submit required Affidavits. Bid number not displayed because their forms were not completed correctly.

MOTION made by Mr. Williamson and SECONDED by Mr. Hoge that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Belgray, Inc. for the Five Year Global Concrete Contract in the amount of \$1,258,976 for the base years for Known Concrete Work and Miscellaneous Concrete work and \$892,650 for option years one (1) and two (2) for Known Concrete Work and Miscellaneous Concrete Work and \$681,062 for the term of the contract for Potential Concrete Work for a grand total of \$2,832,688. This procurement will be funded 80% through Federal grant funds. The Motion was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #5 – Group Dental Insurance

Ms. Beth Bailey of McGohan Brabender made a presentation to the Committees regarding Group Dental Insurance. RTA currently has a contract with McGohan Brabender for Employee Benefit Consulting Services.

Mr. Stevens also shared information with the Committees. In order for RTA to provide continued dental insurance for employees, proposals were requested for group dental insurance for all salaried and hourly employees. Proposers were asked to provide Fully Insured rates and/or Self-Funded/Administrative Services Only (ASO) rates. One of RTA’s core values is Our People, and providing dental insurance at affordable rates to employees recognizes the employee’s importance while upholding RTA’s responsibility of good stewardship of financial resources.

Proposals were sent to twenty-one (21) firms with eight (8) proposals being received. The Evaluation Committee reviewed the proposals using the following criteria:

- Premiums and expected net cost
- Compliance with plan design requirements
- Capability of meeting RTA’s level of service requirements
- Completion of questionnaire

The following firms submitted proposals:

FULLY FUNDED

Firm	Year 1		Year 2		Year 3	
Superior Dental Care Centerville, OH	Emp	\$19.95	Emp	\$19.95	Emp	\$21.55
	Emp+1	\$39.71	Emp+1	\$39.71	Emp+1	\$42.89
	Fam	\$77.14	Fam	\$77.14	Fam	\$83.31
						(8% Rate Cap)
Dental Care Plus, Inc. Cincinnati, OH	*		*		*	
Delta Dental Plan of Ohio, Inc. Dublin, OH	*		*		*	
Beam Dental/Dehan Enterprises Ins. & Financial Services LLC Columbus, OH	*		*		*	
Anthem Blue Cross & Blue Shield Mason, OH	*		*		*	
United Concordia Dental Harrisburg, PA	*		*		*	
Metropolitan Life Ins. Co. Cincinnati, OH	*		*		*	
Standard Insurance Co.** Cincinnati, OH	*		*		*	

SELF FUNDED/ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES ONLY

Firm	Year 1		Year 2		Year 3	
Superior Dental Care Centerville, OH	Emp	\$20.07	Emp	\$20.87	Emp	\$21.71
	Emp+1	\$37.13	Emp+1	\$38.62	Emp+1	\$40.16
	Fam	\$69.33	Fam	\$72.10	Fam	\$74.98
Dental Care Plus, Inc. Cincinnati, OH	*		*		*	
Delta Dental Plan of Ohio, Inc. Dublin, OH	*		*		*	
Beam Dental/Dehan Enterprises Ins. & Financial Services LLC Columbus, OH	*		*		*	
Anthem Blue Cross & Blue Shield Mason, OH	*		*		*	
United Concordia Dental Harrisburg, PA	*		*		*	
Metropolitan Life Ins. Co. Cincinnati, OH	*		*		*	
Standard Insurance Co.** Cincinnati, OH	*		*		*	

* FTA Procurement regulations require that only the successful proposer's pricing data be disclosed publicly.

** The Standard Insurance Co. was determined non-responsive for failure to submit complete documentation.

RTA moved to a Self-Funded/ASO plan in September 2012. The current contract expires December 31, 2018. In order to continue the current level of coverage in the most cost effective manner it is recommended that RTA remain self-funded. Open enrollment is aligned with the open enrollment process for medical insurance that occurs during the fourth quarter of each year.

Superior Dental annualized estimates based on the current census of 584 employees:

Estimated Monthly Administrative Fee to Carrier	\$1,694
Estimated Annual Administrative Fee to Carrier	\$20,323
Estimated Annual Claims Liability	\$250,045
Estimated Annual Total Cost	\$270,368
Percent Change from Current*	3.99%

* Self-Funding allows RTA to set this rate where we are most comfortable, within reason.

The actual dental claims shall be paid by RTA through funds appropriated in the Operating budget for employee dental benefits and the funds withheld by Payroll for employee contributions to dental benefits. Superior's estimated claims amounts for Years 2 and 3 have been increased by 4% based on market trend. The estimated claims to be paid by RTA are:

Contract Year	Est. Claims
Year (1/1/19-12/31/19)	\$250,045
Year 2 (1/1/20-12/31/20)	\$260,047
Year 3 (1/1/21-12/31/21)	\$270,449
Total Estimated Claims	\$780,541

RTA's claims experience for the 2017 plan year exceeded the budgeted total costs by 1.7%. The claims experience for the first six months of the 2018 plan year exceeded the budgeted total by 3.7%. Considering this trend factor, a demographic adjustment (number of employees, employee +1, and

families enrolled), and adjustments for inflation in future years, it is recommended RTA increase the monthly group dental rates by 4% per year from the current rates as follows:

3-Tier Rates	Current	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Employee	\$18.93	\$19.69	\$20.47	\$21.29
Employee +1	\$37.72	\$39.23	\$40.80	\$42.43
Family	\$64.84	\$67.43	\$70.13	\$72.94

RTA has the ability to annually review the actual claims experience and adjust these rates up or down, as needed. Employees currently pay 20% of the premium. Employees actively enrolled in the wellness plan and who meet the plan requirements will pay 10% of the premium.

MOTION made by Ms. Howard and SECONDED by Mr. Williamson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Superior Dental Care for Self-Funded/ASO Group Dental Administrative fees and estimated claims for the following total annual estimated amounts:

Description	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Grand Total
Estimated Annual Administrative Fee to Carrier	\$ 20,323	\$ 20,323	\$ 20,323	\$ 60,969
Estimated Annual Claims	\$250,045	\$260,047	\$270,449	\$780,541
Estimated Annual Total Cost	\$270,368	\$280,370	\$290,772	\$841,510

The actual award amount will vary based on the census. Group Dental Insurance is included in the Operating budget. The Motion was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #6 – Resolution No. 2018-10-1, FAST Act Flexible Funding

Mr. Ruzinsky explained that RTA has been notified by the Miami Valley Regional Planning Commission (MVRPC) regarding the solicitation of new transportation projects under the Congestion Mitigation Air Quality (CMAQ) and Surface Transportation Program (STP). Once submitted, applications for the proposed new projects are to be reviewed and evaluated for possible inclusion in the State Transportation Improvement Program (TIP).

In reviewing the region’s transportation needs, Staff has developed the following project that is eligible for flexible funding, and the proposal has been scrutinized in the context of MVRPC practices and policies:

Twenty Five Small “Connect/ADA” Replacement Buses \$2,375,000 (\$95,000 per bus) CMAQ/STP funds @ 80% \$1,900,000 (\$76,000 per bus)

- **Project Description:**

The replacement of our bus fleet is a top priority for RTA. We have worked diligently over the past 5 years to ensure we have the funding to replace and modernize our large transit bus fleet. We have been successful and by 2022 we will have replaced all our large buses, including the 20+ year old trolley buses.

We are now working to ensure our fleet of small transit buses is replaced in a timely manner to ensure these vehicles, which are the backbone of our services that provide transportation

for those who are not able to ride the larger fixed route buses. As the region's population continues to age, these vehicles will become even a more important part of our fleet, and the services we provide. In addition, these vehicle are used to provide public transit in areas where a large bus is not able to maneuver, or where service demands do not warrant fixed route service.

Today this fleet is made up of 75 small transit buses. These buses have a 5-7 year life cycle and we will need to replace them in batches during the first half of the 2020's. This request will cover the replacement of 25 of the 75 we currently operate.

RTA's goal is to always provide the citizens of our service area with clean, safe, modern, transit buses and to ensure rides are comfortable and RTA projects a positive image across our community. Approve of this request, which would provide for the replacement of a third of our small bus fleet, will help ensure we continue to meet that goal.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Weckesser that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of Resolution No. 2018-10-1, authorizing the submittal of all necessary documents and the fulfillment of all other requirements, in order to obtain additional funding for projects approved by the MVRPC. The Motion was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Informational and Discussion Items:

Customer and Business Development Update

Mr. Policicchio stated the Customer and Business Development Department previously included in today's meeting packet a summary document of recent activities. Mr. Policicchio stated that he would be happy to answer any questions related to this summary document.

KPI Data Review

Ms. Julie Beard reported on KPI data which was included in today's meeting packet. There were no questions from Committees members regarding this report.

June 2018 Sales Tax Update

The information was not available at the Committees meeting. After the meeting Ms. Stanforth reported via email that June 2018 Sales Tax receipts equal \$3,318,939 which is 1.5% or \$50,000 lower than the June 2018 Budget.

Year-to-Date (YTD) June 2018 Sales Tax receipts equal \$18,562,884 which is 1.7% or \$329,000 lower than the YTD June 2018 Budget. Results continue to track very close to budget year-to-date. Staff will continue to monitor and report on Sales Tax on a monthly basis.

August 2018 Financial Statements

Ms. Stanforth reported that for the month of August 2018 RTA's Net Income after Local Depreciation is \$449,715 compared to Budgeted Net Loss of \$113,410. Operating revenues were \$10,000 above budget while operating expenses, excluding depreciation, were \$115,000 over budget. RTA Local depreciation expense was \$5,000 over budget while non-operating revenues were \$673,000 above budget. The non-operating revenue positive variance was the biggest contributing factor in the month's positive result.

RTA's August Year-to Date (YTD) Net Loss after Local Depreciation is \$140,027 compared to YTD Budgeted Net Loss of \$206,618. Operating revenues were \$114,000 above budget while operating expenses, excluding depreciation, were \$232,000 over budget. RTA Local depreciation expense was \$22,000 under budget while non-operating revenues \$163,000 above budget. At the end of August, we are on-target to achieve a balanced operating result by year's end.

The details and variance explanations associated with the financial statements are included in today's Committees Meeting Package.

Small Purchasing Information

Ms. Deborah Howard stated Small Purchasing Information was previously included in today's meeting packet. There were no questions from Committees members regarding this report.

Next Meeting Dates

A Jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meeting will be held on November 20 and December 18, 2018. Meetings will start promptly at 8:30 a.m.

Adjournment

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Howard to ADJOURN the meeting. The motion was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0. The meeting adjourned at 10:38 a.m.

Attest


Sharon Hairston, Chair


Mary Stanforth, Committee Secretary