

Jointly Held
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees
Meeting Minutes

March 20, 2019

Members Present: David Williamson, Jointly Held Committee Chair
Vince Corrado
Sharon Hairston
Adrienne Heard (arrived 9:45am)
Franz Hoge
Belinda Matthews Stenson (arrived 8:39am)
Tom U. Weckesser

Excused Absence: Sharon Howard
John Lumpkin

Staff in Attendance: Mark Donaghy
Daron Brown
Sally Brown
Roland Caldwell
Chris Cole
Rick Talda, Coolidge Wall Co., L.P.A.
Tim Harrington
Deborah Howard
Brandon Policicchio
Bob Ruzinsky
Mary K. Stanforth
Robert Stevens

Call to Order

Mr. Williamson called the meeting to order at 8:32 a.m. A quorum was present and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

Approval of January 15, 2019 Meeting Minutes

Mr. Williamson asked if attendees desired a reading of the minutes or if there were any corrections to the minutes? Upon hearing no requests or corrections, Mr. Williamson declared ACCEPTANCE of the January 15, 2019 meeting minutes.

March 2019 Board Action Items:

Action Item #2 – Purchase of Steel Strain Trolley Poles

Mr. Ruzinsky stated that the purpose of this procurement is to contract with a vendor for the purchase of steel strain trolley poles for the Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA). This project is consistent with RTA's core values of Safety, Integrity, and Stewardship as we demonstrate our commitment to improve the overhead trolley system infrastructure. These poles will be utilized for anticipated upcoming infrastructure projects over the next five (5) years.

Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority

4 S. Main Street Dayton, OH 45402 • 937-425-8400 P • 937-425-8416 F • www.irderta.org

The successful vendor will provide the steel strain poles per RTA's specifications to successfully fulfill our needs for the next five (5) years. The poles will be delivered to RTA and then be moved to the designated installation points as needed. The steel strain trolley poles will be received and stored as inventory and will be expensed to the various projects as they are used. The actual quantities ordered could fluctuate up or down depending upon our needs. The unit cost will remain the same no matter how many are ordered.

Sealed bids for the Purchase of Steel Strain Poles were solicited through the Dayton Daily News, Dayton Weekly News, and Transit Talent. Invitations for Bid were sent to four (4) firms. At 2:00 p.m. on January 22, 2019, two (2) bids were received and publicly opened.

RTA's needs are for a five (5) year contract and Path Master was considered non-responsive for only bidding on three of the five contract years. The two (2) vendors that did not submit a bid were contacted as to why they did not bid. There are now only two approved pole manufacturers who are Union Metal and Millerbernd. Becker Electric is the Ohio distributor for Millerbernd while Path Master is the Ohio distributor for Union Metal. Wesco did not bid because they were not selected to be an Ohio distributor by either of the manufacturers. The other vendor, VSI Sales, did not bid because they failed to submit a Request for Approved Equal for their poles.

Neither of the two bidders bid on the option years because of the risk associated with the increase in the price of steel. The increases from 2017 until now on the trolley poles averages 28% due to the rising costs of steel which has increased 107 % since October of 2016.

Since there was only one (1) responsive bidder this bid was changed to a negotiated procurement. A request was made to Becker Electric for their Best and Final Offer (BAFO) which did not result in a price reduction. A price analysis was performed and after comparing their costs to the pricing provided by Path Master, previous pricing and the pricing submitted by Becker Electric, it has been determined to be fair and reasonable.

An order was placed under small purchases earlier this year in the amount of \$94,910 with Path Master because they were the only vendor that would commit to an eighteen (18) week delivery time frame which will allow RTA to receive the needed poles in a timely manner. The delivery time on the current procurement is thirty-eight (38) weeks plus the estimated time to get this procurement from release to approval of three (3) months.

In accordance with FTA Accounting Standards, these poles will be originally purchased with local funds and placed in inventory. As they are used, they will be charged to the proper capital or operating accounts at which time FTA will reimburse us 80% of the cost.

MOTION made by Mr. Hoge and SECONDED by Ms. Matthews Stenson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a five (5) year contract be AWARDED to Becker Electric for the Purchase of Steel Strain Poles for a total to be awarded of \$6,267,391, and to ratify the above amount of \$94,910 spent with Path Master for a total of \$6,362,301.

Motion APPROVED by voice vote of 6-0.

Action Item #3 – Trapeze OPS Workforce Management

Mr. Harrington explained that Trapeze Software Group is the sole provider of the Trapeze OPS software. In early 2017, the Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) placed the OPS Dispatch/Timekeeping system into production status. In September 2017, the Board approved a total of \$148,700 in funds for Trapeze Professional and Technical Services for the creation of additional reports; review, configuration, testing, and implementation services for the OPS Workforce Management (attendance tracking) System; and other Trapeze OPS & PASS needs. The award included a \$25,000 allowance for Workforce Management due to refined requirements that were not yet identified.

As part of the OPS Workforce Management (WFM) implementation, software gaps were found during the project design review meetings and discussions with RTA. It was found that complex customizations would be necessary to fill the gaps between the base system and RTA’s needs, and the cost would exceed the allowance previously awarded as follows:

Description	Total
Software Licenses	\$66,442
Implementation Services:	
• Configure absence tracking for full and part-time administrative AFSCME Union employees, full and part-time nonunion employees, part-time fixed route and part-time paratransit employees.	19,475
• Configure setup for Family Medical Leave relationships/absences	12,913
• Enhancement of .5 credit given for 160 regular hours worked within a calendar month.	42,138
• Configuration of annual uniform allowance tracking for Maintenance employees.	5,738
Total Cost	\$146,706

The purchase of professional services to configure the performance of Trapeze Workforce Management software already owned will allow staff to utilize it to its full capabilities. This supports RTA’s core value of Stewardship through the effective and efficient use of agency resources.

Since this is a sole source, a cost analysis was performed. Based on comparison of the additional license costs to the original license costs and past Trapeze implementation daily rates, the cost was found fair and reasonable.

This procurement will be funded with 80% Federal grant funds.

MOTION made by Mr. Weckesser and SECONDED by Mr. Hoge that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Trapeze Software Group, Inc. in the not to exceed amount of \$146,706 for the purchase of Trapeze professional services for Workforce Management.

Motion APPROVED by voice vote 6-0.

Action Item #4 – Connect Paratransit – Mobility Providers

Mr. Policicchio explained that on June 20, 2017, the Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) Board of Trustees approved a five year contract for paratransit services to Anton’s Cab Service LLC and Dayton Fast Cab, LLC at an estimated total aggregate cost of \$200,000 per year, for a total estimated aggregate award not to exceed \$1,000,000 over the five year period ending in 2022. To date, RTA has spent \$50,345 of the total awarded budget for this procurement.

The purpose of the June 2017 Alternative Transit Providers procurement was to select qualified transit providers to provide assistance in the delivery of ADA (Americans with Disabilities Act) complementary paratransit and general demand-responsive services.

While the procurement has assisted in the delivery of paratransit services to date, it does not provide RTA the ability to respond to the ongoing growth in paratransit ridership. Currently, RTA’s existing providers are unable at times to meet the demand and/or are unable to assist with same day services. In addition, both providers are unable to serve customers utilizing mobility devices also known as non-ambulatory customers.

Therefore, in order to meet RTA’s current and expected increase for services and acquire providers who can serve non-ambulatory customers, RTA developed and sought out services through a new Request for Proposal (RFP) which will allow RTA to add qualified providers as needed, throughout the duration of the remaining three year period. This project is consistent with RTA’s Core Value of Quality Service as we recognize our customers as our highest priority.

The selected transit providers will represent the RTA and must meet performance measures for ADA service as defined by the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) and RTA. Measures include, but are not limited to, on-time performance, missed trips, trip lengths, and complaint monitoring.

Proposals were solicited through the *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly News*, and *Transit Talent*. Request for Proposals were sent to 24 providers. At 2:00 p.m. on February 25, 2019, four (4) proposals were received. The Evaluation Committee reviewed the proposals to determine the most qualified proposers using the following criteria:

Evaluation Criteria

- Requirements outlined within the scope of work
- Background and experience
- Reasonableness of cost

The following providers submitted a proposal:

Provider

- Anton’s Cab Service LLC, Dayton, OH
- GoRide Health, LLC, Taylor, MI
- Owl, Inc., Jacksonville, FL
- Universal Transportation Systems (UTS), West Chester, OH

Providers were asked if they could provide ambulatory, non-ambulatory, or both types of service.

Two (2) of the providers proposing are able to provide non-ambulatory service.

The pricing received follows:

**Connect Paratransit – Mobility Providers
Contract Years 1 – 3**

RFP GD 19-04 Connect Paratransit Pricing Chart												
	Anton's Cab Service *			GoRide Health, LLC **			Owl, Inc. ***			Universal Transportation Systems (UTS) ****		
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Subscription/Casual Paratransit (Ambulatory)												
Base Fare	\$ 9.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 35.00	\$ 35.00	\$ 35.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 24.46	\$ 25.68	\$ 26.96
Per Mile	\$ 2.50	\$ 2.50	\$ 2.50	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 2.59	\$ 2.72	\$ 2.86
Per Minute	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Minimum Fare	\$ 9.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 9.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 29.64	\$ 31.12	\$ 32.68
Booking Fee	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Per Person	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 33.00	\$ 33.00	\$ 33.00	\$ 45.00	\$ 45.00	\$ 45.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Per Mile	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 2.90	\$ 2.90	\$ 2.90	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Same Day Paratransit (Ambulatory)												
Base Fare	\$ 9.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 35.00	\$ 35.00	\$ 35.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 24.46	\$ 25.68	\$ 26.96
Per Mile	\$ 2.50	\$ 2.50	\$ 2.50	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 3.36	\$ 3.53	\$ 3.71
Per Minute	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Minimum Fare	\$ 9.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 9.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 31.18	\$ 32.74	\$ 34.38
Booking Fee	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Per Person	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 33.00	\$ 33.00	\$ 33.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 50.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Per Mile	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 2.90	\$ 2.90	\$ 2.90	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Subscription/Casual Paratransit (Non-Ambulatory)												
Base Fare	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 35.00	\$ 35.00	\$ 35.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 35.00	\$ 36.75	\$ 38.59
Per Mile	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 3.00	\$ 3.15	\$ 3.31
Per Minute	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Minimum Fare	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 41.00	\$ 43.05	\$ 45.20
Booking Fee	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Per Person	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 33.00	\$ 33.00	\$ 33.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 50.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Per Mile	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 2.90	\$ 2.90	\$ 2.90	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Same Day Paratransit (Non-Ambulatory)												
Base Fare	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 35.00	\$ 35.00	\$ 35.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 35.00	\$ 36.75	\$ 38.59
Per Mile	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 4.00	\$ 4.20	\$ 4.41
Per Minute	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Minimum Fare	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 43.00	\$ 45.15	\$ 47.41
Booking Fee	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Per Person	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 33.00	\$ 33.00	\$ 33.00	\$ 55.00	\$ 55.00	\$ 55.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Per Mile	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 2.90	\$ 2.90	\$ 2.90	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	* \$9.00 minimum covers the first 3 miles, then the per mile fare kicks in.			** They offered two pricing formats. Subscribe to 600 trips for a monthly flat rate of \$19,800 (\$33 per trip) or a flat rate of \$35 per trip each way. They offer discounts for late pickups, no show, and cancellations.			***Per mile charge kicks in on anything over 15 miles.			**** Two Mile Minimum Trip.		

A price analysis was performed, and all provider fares were determined fair and reasonable.

Connect Paratransit – Mobility Provider services will be paid with operating funds. The budget will be approved by the Board of Trustees as part of the annual budget process based on estimated need and will be included in the annual budget document, thereby allowing for flexibility in annual amounts.

MOTION made by Mr. Corrado and SECONDED by Mr. Hoge that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees that AWARDS be made to Anton's Cab Service; GoRide Health, LLC; Owl, Inc.; and Universal Transportation Systems (UTS) at an estimated total aggregate cost of \$333,333 per year, for a total estimated aggregate award not to exceed \$1,000,000 for the three year period. Funds will be allocated to providers based on the operating needs of the RTA, cost of services and the availability of providers. In addition, that the Chief Executive Officer is authorized to carry out all actions necessary to add additional qualified providers as needed throughout the duration of the contract period.

Motion APPROVED by voice vote 6-0.

Action Item #5 – On-Demand - Mobility Access

Mr. Policicchio explained that the Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) is seeking to enter into partnership agreements with qualified mobility providers to support the RTA On-Demand - Mobility Access Pilot Program with a unified goal of enhancing and increasing mobility access within the region. This project is consistent with RTA's Core Value of Quality Service as we recognize our customers as our highest priority.

On-Demand offers our customers more mobility options by increasing access in unserved and underserved areas. This service complements our existing fixed route services, providing customers more choice in their travel planning.

On April 4, 2017, the Board of Trustees authorized RTA to enter into partnership agreements with transit network providers and other transportation providers. The goal of this pilot program is to enhance and increase mobility access in previously unserved and underserved areas in the county. On August 7, 2018 the Board of Trustees approved amendments to the program which included changes to the program structure and extension of the program for an addition year to June 2020.

A total of \$100,000 was made available under the pilot program. Three (3) vendors were used. To date, RTA has spent \$68,762 of the total awarded budget for this procurement.

The selected transportation providers will represent the RTA and must meet performance measures set by the RTA. Measures include, but are not limited to, on-time performance, missed trips, trip lengths, and complaint monitoring.

Proposals were solicited through the Dayton Daily News, Dayton Weekly News, and Transit Talent. Request for Proposals were sent to 24 providers. At 3:00 p.m., on February 25, 2019, three (3) proposals were received.

The Evaluation Committee reviewed the proposals to determine the most qualified proposer using the following criteria:

Evaluation Criteria

- Requirements outlined within the Scope of Work
- Reasonableness of cost

The following providers submitted a proposal:

Provider
 GoRide Health, LLC, Taylor, MI
 Anton’s Cab Service LLC, Dayton, OH
 Lyft Inc., San Francisco, CA

The pricing received follows:

On-Demand – Mobility Access

RFP GD 19-05 On Demand - Mobility Access Pricing Chart			
Trip within outlined location	GoRide Health, LLC	Anton’s Cab Service*	Lyft Inc. **
Base Fare	\$ 33.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 1.00
Minimum	\$ 33.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 3.85
Per Mile	-	\$ 2.50	\$ 0.91
Per Minute	-	-	\$ 0.18
Trip outside outlined area		\$2 fee	\$2 Surcharge for airport trips
Door-to Door Service	\$25 Base + \$2.75/mile		
		*Base fare covers the first 3 miles then the per mile fee kicks in	** Service and Applicable fees may apply

A price analysis was performed, and all provider fares were determined fair and reasonable.

On Demand – Mobility Access providers will be paid with restricted local operating funds. The anticipated budget for On-Demand - Mobility Access will be an estimated total of \$600,000 through June 2020. Future budgets will be approved by the Board of Trustees as part of the annual budget process based on estimated need thereby allowing for flexibility in annual amounts.

After reviewing and evaluating the proposals submitted, the Chief Executive Officer recommends MOTION made by Ms. Matthews Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Hoge that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees that AWARDS be made to GoRide Health, LLC; Anton's Cab Service LLC; and Lyft Inc. for a total estimated award not to exceed \$600,000 through June 2020. Funds will be divided as needed between the current and future number of providers and based upon customer choice of provider. In addition, that the Chief Executive Officer is authorized to carry out all actions necessary to add additional qualified providers as needed throughout the duration of the contract period.

Motion APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Informational and Discussion Items:

Customer and Business Development Update

Mr. Policicchio previously included in today's meeting packet a summary document of recent activities in the Customer and Business Development Department. Activities to mention include:

- Trivia Night on The Flyer
- What Drives You Campaign Updates
- Ohio Love Transit Day Recap
- RTA Connect On-Demand Communications Plan
- RTA Celebrates Black History Month
- Community Relations Report January 15 – March 20, 2019

KPI Data Review

Mr. Donaghy stated the KPI data was placed around the table today. Mr. Cole highlighted specific information related to the reports including: Paratransit On-Time Performance, Passenger Boardings per Revenue Hour, Employee Unplanned Absenteeism, and Road Calls. This is the information resulting from the ABBG.

December 2018 Sales Tax Update

Ms. Stanforth reported for the month of December 2018 Sales Tax receipts equal \$3,725,417 and State of Ohio Transitional Aid is \$172,957. The Grand Total of \$3,898,374 reflects a 9.5% or \$409,000 decrease versus December 2017. When compared to the December 2018 Budget, we are down \$52,862 or 1.3%.

Year-to-Date (YTD) December 2018 Sales Tax receipts equal \$38,169,646 and State of Ohio Transitional Aid is \$3,963,114. The YTD Grand Total of \$42,132,760 reflects a 0.1% or \$33,813 increase versus YTD December 2017. When compared to YTD December 2018 Budget, we are up \$378,760 or 0.9% (positive variance).

February 2019 Financial Statements

Ms. Stanforth reported for the month of February 2019 RTA's *Net Loss after Local Depreciation* is \$110,770 compared to a Budgeted Net Loss of \$312,212. Operating revenues were \$29,000 (4%) below budget. Operating expenses, excluding depreciation, were \$175,000 (3%) below budget. RTA Local depreciation expense was equal to budget while non-operating revenues (expenses) were \$56,000 (1%) better than budget.

RTA's Year-to Date (YTD) *Net Loss after Local Depreciation* is \$947,133 compared to YTD Budgeted Net Loss of \$1,403,291. Operating revenues were \$71,000 (5%) above budget. Operating expenses, excluding depreciation, were \$219,000 (2%) below budget. RTA Local depreciation expense was \$11,000 (3%) over budget. Finally, non-operating revenues (expenses) were \$177,000 (2%) better than budget.

The details and variance explanations associated with the financial statements are included in today's Committees Meeting Package.

Operating and Capital Acquisition Schedules

Ms. Howard stated the Operating and Capital Acquisition Schedules were previously included in today's meeting packet. There were no questions from Committees members regarding the Schedules.

Contracts Over \$100,000 Summary and Small Purchasing Information

Ms. Howard stated the Contracts Summary and Small Purchasing Information were previously included in today's meeting packet. There were no questions from Committees members regarding these reports.

Next Meeting Dates

A Jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meeting will be held on April 16 and May 21, 2019.

Adjournment

Hearing no objections, Mr. Williamson DECLARED the meeting ADJOURNED. The meeting adjourned at 10:32 a.m.

Attest



David Williamson, Chair



Brandon Policicchio, Committee Secretary