



**Jointly Held
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees
Meeting Minutes**

April 19, 2022

Members Present: John A. Lumpkin, Jointly Held Committees Chair
Vince Corrado
Al Fullenkamp
Adrienne Heard
Sharon Howard
Belinda Matthews-Stenson
Thomas Weckesser
David P. Williamson

Excused: Sharon Hairston

Staff in Attendance: Bob Ruzinsky
Daron Brown
Roland Caldwell
Chris Conard, Coolidge Wall Co., L.P.A.
Tim Harrington
Deborah Howard
Brandon Policicchio
Mary Kay Stanforth

Due to matters surrounding Covid-19 today's meeting is being conducted remotely by teleconference and/or videoconference, in accordance with Ohio House Bill 51.

Mr. Lumpkin called the meeting to order at 8:32 a.m. and roll call was taken:

Roll Call

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Excused
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

A quorum was present, and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

Approval of March 15, 2022 Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees Meeting Minutes

Mr. Lumpkin asked if attendees request a reading of the minutes or have corrections to the minutes. There were no requests or corrections.

MOTION made by Mr. Fullenkamp and SECONDED by Mr. Weckesser to APPROVE the March 15, 2022 Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meeting minutes.

Roll call vote was taken:

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Excused
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 8-0.

May 2022 Board Action Items

Action Item #2 – Global Concrete Work

Mr. Ruzinsky explained the purpose of this procurement is to contract with a highly qualified contractor for concrete work throughout Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) facilities, infrastructures, and amenities.

RTA has numerous properties throughout the Montgomery County area that will require concrete work. This work includes, but is not limited to: new concrete, upgrades to existing concrete areas, and/or replacement of concrete areas such as: driveways, interior garage concrete, bus lanes (large pads on a city street), approaches, curbs, curb cuts for wheelchair accessibility, shelter pads, bench pads, small retaining walls, and sidewalk pads – with and/or without pole foundations within the sidewalk pad. In addition, RTA is finalizing plans to upgrade all of the Traction Powered Substations (TPSS). This work will also include the foundation pads as necessary for the installation of the new TPSS.

This project is consistent with RTA’s core values of Stewardship by properly managing our resources and maintaining our assets.

The successful contractor is to provide any concrete work the RTA deems necessary over the next five (5) years, plus two (2) option years.

Sealed Bids for **Global Concrete Work** were solicited through Dayton Daily News and Dayton Weekly News. The Invitation for Bids were sent to thirty-six (36) contractors.

At 2:00 p.m., on Thursday, March 24, 2022, two (2) bids were received and publicly opened. The results are as follows:

Company	Belgray, Inc. Wilmington, OH	*Cobalt Civil, LLC Winchester, IN
Year 1	\$632,310.00	\$1,257,889.20
Year 2	673,255.30	1,289,336.43
Year 3	717,398.40	1,321,569.84
Year 4	764,981.50	1,354,609.09
Year 5	816,452.20	1,388,474.31
Base Total	\$3,604,397.40	\$6,611,878.87
Option Year 1	\$754,669.20	\$1,773,561.17
Option Year 2	806,855.20	1,458,765.83
Option Year Total	\$1,561,524.40	\$3,232,327.00
Total	\$5,165,921.80	*\$9,844,205.87

* Non-responsive.

Global Concrete Work will be partially funded through federal grant funds.

Ms. Heard asked why Cobalt was non-responsive. Ms. Howard replied they did not turn in all required information and paperwork with their proposal.

Mr. Corrado asked about RTA's experience with Belgray. Mr. Ruzinsky replied RTA has contracted with Belgray in the past and they do excellent work with the cost being reasonable and comparable.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Heard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Belgray, Inc. for the purchase of Global Concrete Work in the amount of \$3,604,397 for five (5) base years and \$1,561,525 for two (2) option years for a grand total of \$5,165,922.

Roll call vote was taken:

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Excused
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 8-0.

Action Item #3 – Commercial Interior Products & Services

Mr. Ruzinsky stated the purpose of this procurement is to contract with a qualified firm to provide RTA with commercial interior products, interior design, project management, move and configuration management, warehousing, delivery and installation, and refurbishing services. RTA anticipates awarding a five (5) year contract.

Proposals were solicited through Dayton Daily News, Dayton Weekly News, and Transit Talent. Requests for Proposals were sent to twelve (12) firms.

At 2:00 p.m. on March 22, 2022, one (1) proposal was received and reviewed by the Evaluation Committee.

The committee evaluated the proposal based on the following criteria:

- Corporate Structure Qualification
- Prior Experience
- Reasonableness of Cost
- Past Performance
- Outsourcing
- Contract Sizes
- Warranties
- References and Qualifications of Personnel
- Aesthetics & Function Characteristics
- Product Lines Offered
- Quality of Proposal Preparation

Space & Asset Management, Inc. DBA/Elements IV Interiors was the only firm that submitted a proposal. A survey was taken of other firms on the proposal list, and the reasons for not submitting included just deciding not to act on the RFP at this time; another firm said they were very busy and did not have the time to respond. The last firm to respond to the inquiry stated they had a territory established by their major manufacturers, and Dayton was not in that district.

The furniture industry is experiencing unprecedented delays in delivery. There is short-staffing in factories related to Covid-19. Likewise, furniture establishments are having problems keeping up. Shipping of product also remains a problem.

The pricing received is as follows:

Firm

Space & Asset Management, Inc. DBA/Elements IV Interiors, Dayton, OH

Pricing

- Average Labor Rate - \$66.50/hour
- Design Service and Space Planning Rate - \$60 per hour
- Repair and refurbishment will be quoted at the time of need depending on the commercial product.
- Products will be priced at the best available discounts off State Contracts.

Other services include

Asset Management at \$1 per square foot

Guardsman "Fabric-Coat" Process

- Price Fabric Panel \$24
- Desk Chair \$16
- 2 Seat (ganged) \$30
- 3 Seat (ganged) \$38

- Sofa 2 Seat \$38
- Sofa 3 Seat \$53

Cleaning of Upholstered Products

- Fabric Panel \$23
- Desk Chair \$23
- 2 Seat (ganged) \$30
- Sofa 2 Seat \$90
- Sofa 3 Seat \$107

Space & Asset Management, Inc. DBA/Elements IV Interiors submitted the most competitive proposal of three (3) firms in 2014. The cost analysis compared the pricing received then to the current pricing. Since 2014, pricing on some of the various components of this procurement remained the same, and some increased 10% to 20%. The Consumer Price Index between 2014 and February 2022 increased by 20.84%. Research into cleaning upholstered products revealed that cleaning of the items listed ranges from \$40 to \$300. The pricing was determined to be fair and reasonable when you consider inflation and the risk the vendor is taking by committing to a long-term contract.

After evaluating the proposal based on the stated criteria, it was determined that Space & Asset Management, Inc. DBA/Elements IV Interiors is still qualified to provide this service. Space & Asset Management, Inc. DBA/Elements IV Interiors has an extensive showroom and a wide range of styles and can accommodate all RTA commercial interior product needs.

This procurement will be partially funded with federal funds.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Howard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a five (5) year contract AWARD to Space & Asset Management DBA/Elements IV Interiors for Commercial Interior Products and Services at the rates listed. Annual budgets will be determined by the Board approved Capital Budget each year (for 2022 it is \$50,000).

Roll call vote was taken:

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Excused
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Abstain
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 7-0-1 with Ms. Matthews-Stenson abstaining from the vote.

Customer and Business Development Update

Mr. Policicchio stated the Customer and Business Development Department update was provided in today’s meeting packet.

Mr. Policicchio shared information on RTA's recent public hearings:

89 Total Comments Received:

- 62 (70%) Service/Schedules (Routes 23, 24, X5, 17 referenced the most)
- 13 (15%) Fares
- 11 (12%) Comments on Drivers & Mgt., Driver Wages, RTA Funding
- 3 (3%) Amenities

This represents all comments received via public hearings (28 total), Facebook (44 total), and other means such as voicemail, calling and mailing in. In addition, RTA received several comments via the online interactive planning system, Remix.

Financial Report

Ms. Stanforth provided information regarding the March 2022 financial report. On the revenue side:

- Year to Date (YTD) passenger fare revenue is \$929,000 compared to a \$1.2 million budget. Same time last year we were at \$1.2 million actual.
- Sales tax revenue is equal to the amount budgeted for the first 3 months of the year.
- YTD Federal assistance is \$3.8 million compared to a \$4.9 million budget. This is directly tied to lower operating expenses.
- YTD total revenues are \$15.2 million compared to a budget of \$17.4 million. A negative variance of \$2.2 million results.

On the expense side:

- YTD total wages and fringe benefits are \$10 million compared to a budget of \$12.9 million. This results from fewer employees and fewer routes as a result of Covid. Moving forward – recent ATU wage increase(s) will get us closer to budget.
- YTD materials and supplies expense is \$1.2 million compared to a budget of \$2.2 million. About half of the variance is related to fuel. About half is related to parts and supplies.
- YTD total expenses are \$13.7 million compared to \$18.2 million budget. A \$4.5 million positive variance results.
- YTD after RTA's Local Capital charge (depreciation) we end with a \$700,000 gain.

Additionally:

- The mark to market adjustment from investments is a negative \$1.6 million. This is the result of continued rising interest rates.
- On the last page of the report – 2021 Sales tax increased 13.7% over 2020.

Ohio Transit Risk Pool Update

Ms. Stanforth provided the following update regarding the Ohio Transit Risk Pool (OTRP):

- On December 1, 2021 – RTA's Board awarded a contract to OTRP for insurance coverage which includes the liability and property programs.
- Ohio Transit Risk Pool offered improved coverage with a focus on public transportation.
- At that time the projected annual savings were \$1.2 million – Marsh coverage was \$2.6 million and OTRP coverage is \$1.4 million. The first year savings were used to fund RTA's shock loss fund.
- We now have a much lower deductible for liability coverage - moving from \$500k to \$100k

At the time of transition RTA had 55 Open Claims, and one goal was to look at quickly resolving the smaller ones. Since that time half of the total open claims have been resolved.

Since the transition occurred, three large injury claims have been settled:

- Willis Estate – \$100,000 deductible
- Nelson – \$500,000 deductible
- Price Estate – \$500,000 deductible

Mr. Policicchio then detailed RTA Training Department initiatives.

Small Purchasing Information

Ms. Stanforth stated the Small Purchasing Information was included in today’s meeting packet. There were no questions regarding small purchases.

Request for Executive Session

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Heard to RECESS into Executive Session for the purpose of discussing labor negotiations.

Roll call vote was taken:

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Excused
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 8-0.

The meeting recessed into Executive Session at 9:04 a.m.

MOTION made by Ms. Heard and SECONDED by Ms. Matthews-Stenson to RECONVENE into Regular Session.

Roll call vote was taken:

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Excused
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 8-0.

The regular meeting reconvened at 9:13 a.m.

Other Business

Mr. Williamson asked for an update regarding mask requirements. Mr. Ruzinsky stated masks are no longer required on RTA buses or property.

Mr. Williamson commented he is very appreciative of recent marketing efforts, especially those related to the Day in the Life video seen on television! Mr. Williamson and the Board agreed the video is excellent!

Next Meeting

The upcoming jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meeting will be held on May 17, 2022.

Adjournment

MOTION made by Ms. Howard and SECONDED by Ms. Heard to ADJOURN the meeting. The motion was approved by voice vote 8-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:20 a.m.

ATTEST

for 

John Lumpkin, Chair



Mary K. Stanforth, Committee Secretary